



Sveriges lantbruksuniversitet
Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences

Faculty of Natural Resources and
Agricultural Sciences

Profit-making businesswomen or (too) proud women and prostitutes?

– Change and continuity in the social practice of gender at
Kiwira market, Tanzania

Nora Wahlström

Profit-making businesswomen or (too) proud women and prostitutes?
- Change and continuity in the social practice of gender at Kiwira market, Tanzania

Nora Wahlström

Supervisor: Katarina Pettersson, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences, Department of Urban and Rural Development

Examiner: Örjan Bartholdson, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences, Department of Urban and Rural Development

Credits: 30 credits

Level: Second cycle, A2E

Course title: Master thesis in Rural Development, A2E - Agriculture Programme - Rural Development

Course code: EX0890

Course coordinating department: Department of Urban and Rural Development

Programme/Education: Agriculture Programme - Rural Development

Place of publication: Uppsala

Year of publication: 2019

Copyright: all featured images are used with permission from copyright owner.

Online publication: <https://stud.epsilon.slu.se>

Keywords: market women, rural development, gender, gender practices

Sveriges lantbruksuniversitet
Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences

Faculty of Natural Resources and Agricultural Sciences
Department of Urban and Rural Development

Abstract

African women's involvement in the informal economy as market sellers is a topic which has received substantial attention, often with an interest in the possibility of empowerment which comes from earning money and conducting business outside of the household. However, this topic suffers from an urban bias as well as a focus mainly on West Africa. The aim of this master thesis is to investigate the social practice of gender in and around a rural market in Tanzania- how these gendered practices affect businesswomen's opportunities- as well as how the women's business activities form the basis of new practices and discourses. The analysis is based on a six-week field study conducted at the Kiwira Market in the rural district of Rungwe in Southwest Tanzania using qualitative methods such as semi-structured interviews, focus group discussions and ethnographic observations. The material obtained has been analyzed by use of analytical concepts such as gender practices, women's access to capitals, women's mobility as well as gendered symbolic violence and doxic versus heterodox gender relations. The study has found that gendered institutions and practices concerning land ownership, control over cash and the ability to travel within the business all form constraints to women's businesses. Results also show that women's activities and earnings at the marketplace has formed the basis of a new discourse which challenges normative ideas about gendered responsibilities within the household. Crucial to this new discourse is the social capital which women form at the marketplace. While the new discourse on gendered responsibilities point to transformation of gender norms, reproduction of gender concerning morals around women's travels continues to limit the mobility of market women.

Key words: market women, rural development, gender, gender practices

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank everyone who has been part in making this thesis possible. A special thanks to all the fascinating market saleswomen I got the opportunity to speak to. Thank you also to the officials working at the market as well as the Chairman and the Vice Chairwoman of the Traders Union who helped me put together focus groups and arrange interviews.

Without my local supervisor and translator in field, Kissa Mwaisoba, nothing of this would have been possible. You have been my guide to Tanzanian culture, an excellent translator, a good friend and a fearless spider-killer.

Thank you also to my supervisor, Katarina Pettersson, for your advice and support!

Table of contents

1	Introduction	5
1.1	Informality and Kiwira market	7
1.2	Study sight and methodology	7
	1.2.1 Data collection	9
	1.2.2 Considerations	12
1.3	Theoretical background	13
	1.3.1 Capitals of importance at the marketplace	13
	1.3.2 Doing gender- masculinities/femininities, institutions and mobilities	14
	1.3.3 Reproduction or change of gender relations? - Symbolic violence and doxa/heterodoxy	16
2	Findings	18
2.1	Gender and financial capital in Rungwe	19
	2.1.1 Access to financial capital- institutions and practices	19
	2.1.2 Competing truths- who is the breadwinner of the family?	22
	Discussions on separation	25
	Kiburi- acting proud	26
2.2	Gender and mobility in Rungwe	27
	2.2.1 'Good' and 'bad' women at the marketplace	31
2.3	Social capital at the marketplace	34
	2.3.1 Seller-customer relationships	34
	2.3.2 Relationships between sellers	37
	2.3.3 Forming groups for credit	37
	2.3.4 Being 'trustworthy'	38
	2.3.5 Social capital, a means of resistance?	40
3	Concluding discussion- change and continuity in the social practice of gender	42
4	References	45

1 Introduction

The morning bus ride from Tukuyu town up north towards Mbeya city offers a stunning scenery. The road, which starts at lake Malawi in the south and ends in Mbeya city, winds along the ridge of the mountain, displaying hillsides and valleys on both sides of the bus. The mild and humid climate of Mbeya Region makes excellent conditions for agricultural production and amongst the dense green I can spot tea plantations, avocado and banana trees. The bus makes frequent stops in the small villages that we pass. A woman gets on, together with a big bag of dried fish. As the bus is already full, we squeeze in to make space for her. The smell of fish fills the bus. On both sides of the road I can see women walking with big harvests of green bananas on their backs. The bus now shares the road with several motorbikes, with men driving and women on the passenger seats, holding onto bags of rice and maize. We are soon approaching Kiwira market, the districts largest food market. Before my departure from Sweden, I had heard about the women sellers of Kiwira from a researcher who had been in the district Kyela, just south of Rungwe. There, the people he met had spoken about the 'aggressive' women sellers from Tukuyu, with both a tone of respect and suspicion. I wonder what these aggressive women sellers are like, or maybe more specifically: what it is like to be one of these women.

There is much written on the subject of 'market women'. Articles have covered many topics within this field, such as women's access to energy (de Groot *et al*, 2017) and to credit (Schindler, 2010) and the use of mobile phones by market women (Burell, 2014; Svensson & Wamala Larsson, 2016) to name a few. Studies have also been made on social relations at the marketplace (Sowatey *et al*, 2018) and the marketplace as an arena for negotiating gender (Wiley, 2014). However, a majority of these studies concern markets in urban or suburban areas. The lack of coverage on this topic in rural areas has been noted by scholars (Weng, 2015; Pollard *et al*, 2015), as well as by the FAO (Simon, 2007). Another aspect of the literature on market women is its main focus on West Africa, a region which has a long and well-documented history of market saleswomen (Pollard *et al*, 2015). By studying gender relations at the marketplace of Kiwira, situated in the rural areas of southwestern Tanzania, I therefor aim to make a contribution to the literature on market women in rural East Africa.

This thesis is not only about women market sellers, but also about gender. The question concerning many of those who write about market women in low-income countries is: do women's partaking in the economy as business managers lead to more equitable gender relations? This is a complex question. A study on market women and sexual empowerment in Uganda found that while women who are engaged as sellers have earned a higher authority concerning expenditure decisions, they have not when it comes to decisions concerning sex and condom-use (Nyanzi *et al*, 2005). The causal relationship between materialistic changes for women and cultural changes regarding gender norms is one which has been a subject of much debate within feminist theory (McNay, 2004), a debate which complicates the question of what market women's incomes can lead to regarding changed gender norms. Another common topic of discussion within feminist theory is whether to focus on transformative or reproductive aspects of gender relations. In her article from 2005, McLeod investigates the use of Bourdieu in feminist theory considering his- according to his critics- overemphasis on the reproductive elements of gender relations (McLeod, 2005). To avoid the risk of falling into either overly transformative or reproductionist conclusions I will in this thesis use the advice offered by McLeod (2005) in her article, that is, to see both change and continuity of gender as processes which take place simultaneously.

This study will investigate market women in Kiwira, a rural community in south-west Tanzania, particularly characterized by women's involvement in the food trade as it hosts one of the largest markets for food in the region. The aim of this thesis is to analyze the social practice of gender in and around the Kiwira market, as well as investigate the potential of women's business activities in bringing change to conjugal gender relations, norms and values and the women's space of maneuver at large. Specifically, the study will answer,

- What are perceived masculine and feminine practices in Kiwira and how does this affect businesswomen's situation?
- What processes of transformation and reproduction of gender relations can be found in connection to the women's business activities?

Businesswomen's situation will be described through their access to different capitals and by looking at their mobility. When analyzing processes of change, this will be done by using the concepts of doxa, heterodoxy and orthodoxy. Reproduction of gender will be analyzed through the concept of gendered symbolic violence. In the study, differences among women concerning age, marital status and wealth form part of the analysis. Questions concerning ethnicity among the sellers of the market are likely to be an important factor for how cooperation among seller's forms and might affect individual sellers. The importance of ethnicity at marketplaces has been noted elsewhere (see Seligmann, 1993; Tillmar & Lindkvist, 2007). However, because of limitations of time and scope, it is not a topic which will be covered in this thesis.

1.1 Informality and Kiwira market

The subject of 'market women' is often placed under the larger research topic of the 'informal market' (Spring, 2009; Sowatey *et al*, 2018). The term was coined in the 1970's by the economic anthropologist Keith Hart in effort to explain the economy he encountered in Accra and other African capitals, which functioned unlike anything he knew in the Western world (Portes, 2010). However, there exists today no coherent definition of what makes an economy or a market 'informal' (Portes, 2010; Spring, 2009). The defining characteristics according to the ILO have long been "(1) low entry barriers in terms of skill, capital and organization; (2) family ownership of enterprises; (3) small scale of operation; (4) labor intensive with outdated technology and; (5) unregulated and competitive markets (Portes, 2010, p.132). Through this and other similar definitions, the informal economy came to be synonymous with urbanity and poverty. Other contemporary definitions of the informal economy are along the lines of "those actions of economic agents that fail to adhere to the established institutional rules or are denied their protection" (ibid.p.133), or shortly summarized, that part of the economy which is unregistered and unregulated. Lately, the usefulness of the dualistic view of a formal versus an informal economy has been contested (Spring, 2009; Portes, 2010). This because the informal and formal economy often are intertwined. For example, many goods bought formally in the Western world, such as computers and other electrical devices, are manufactured in informal settings in the developing world (Portes, 2010). And in low-income countries, many formal goods are sold informally on street markets, and informal sellers may often be recognized and accepted by the authorities (Simon, 2007). The trade taking place at the Kiwira market, which is the setting of my study, fulfills some of the criteria of an informal economy, others not. It certainly fulfills criteria 1 to 4 of the definition used by the ILO, however the sellers are recognized by the authorities and the market is administered by the local government. Sellers are not illegally avoiding taxes, since they are given a license by the local authorities which confirms that their annual income is low enough to avoid tax. However, this does not mean that the sellers of the market receive any protection from authorities in case of fraud, and the social embeddedness associated with informal markets (Portes, 2010) indeed applies to the Kiwira market. In this thesis I will therefor use theories of the informal economy to analyze social relations at the Kiwira market, although it does not apply to all definitions.

1.2 Study sight and methodology

The empirical material of this thesis has been collected through a six-week field study at Kiwira market in Rungwe district, south western Tanzania, spring of 2019. The study was conducted through qualitative methods including semi-structured interviews, focus group discussions and ethnographic observations. A qualitative field-study allows the researcher to investigate dynamics and processes formed in social interaction, using a contextual knowledge of the specific place

(Bryman, 2016). The sight -Kiwira market- was purposely selected as a place where my research questions were likely to be answered (Flyvbjerg, 2003). The Kiwira market is one of the largest in the region and is placed in the rural area outside of the small town Tukuyu. The food market, held on Tuesdays and Fridays, employs many women who- I was told- are known to be particularly “aggressive and successful” businesswomen. These factors made it a relevant study sight for investigating the connections between women’s business activities and gender.



Figure 1. Map over Rungwe and Mbeya districts. Location of the Kiwira market added in red. (Map Data © 2019 Google Maps)

Kiwira market is situated in Rungwe District, which is part of Mbeya Region. Mbeya Region lies on the Southern Highlands of Tanzania, a mountainous area bordering Malawi, Zambia and lake Nyasa. The high rainfalls and the mild temperature has made the area the number one producer of grains in the country (Mbululu & Nyahirani, 2012). Crops grown in the area include rice, maize, beans, banana and potatoes, and with major cash crops being coffee, tea, cocoa, cardamom and vegetables (Ngailo *et al*, 2016). Rungwe is a rural district with a majority of the population involved in small-scale farming (NBS, 2007). The largest town is Tukuyu, situated approximately 1500 meters above sea level. Tukuyu being the largest town, Rungwe districts is often referred to by people as simply Tukuyu. Kiwira market lies along the road going north up to Mbeya City and is the largest market in the district. It is frequented by costumers all over the district, as well as traders from other parts in Tanzania, who buy products to sell in the big cities. The food market is held on Tuesdays and Fridays, however several sellers also sell outside of the main market on days which are not market-days. During the market-days there is also a large sale of second-hand clothes outside of the market gates. Once a week there is a sale of bananas, the main food-crop in Rungwe, a bit further down the street from the market. The focus of this study has been women sellers in and around the main market, selling food products. The sale of bananas is a system in itself, with sellers from far coming to purchase large amounts of bananas, therefore no sellers of bananas have been part of the study.

The study has been conducted inductively and with an explorative approach. As the area is rather undocumented and hence difficult to gain information about before-hand, this was necessary to ensure that the study focused on relevant issues and posed relevant questions (Creswell, 2014). The first week of the field study consisted of a number of initial interviews after which the interview guide was revised, and the focus groups were planned. One week of field work was followed by one week of processing, analyzing and preparations, and so on for six weeks. This allowed for continuous evaluation of the validity of research questions and methods (Creswell, 2014).

Interviews and focus groups were conducted with the help of my research assistant, Kissa Mwaisoba. She has a master's diploma and is employed at a research institute in Mbeya city, with long experience of conducting interviews and focus group discussions. Furthermore, she is of Nyakyusan ethnicity as most of my informants and spoke both Swahili and Nyakyusa language. We discussed the interview guides and focus group questions thoroughly before they were translated into Swahili. Recordings from interviews were transcribed from English by me while my assistant transcribed the focus groups from Swahili. Kissa also transcribed some parts of the interviews directly from Swahili, where this was regarded necessary.

1.2.1 Data collection

Altogether, 18 semi-structured interviews were conducted. 17 were with women sellers at the market and one was a group interview with three board members of the Traders Union. The interviews with saleswomen focused around their daily lives and their perceptions of their work at the marketplace and in the household. The women were sellers of different crops and displayed a variety in income and age, a summary of these are presented in the table below. The remaining interview was with three board members of The Traders Union. The board members, of which one was the Chairman and one the Vice Chairwoman of the Union, functioned as key informants to me. Because of their responsibilities, they knew most of the sellers and could suggest informants and help put together focus groups. They also had a comprehensive knowledge of the conditions for sellers and the functioning of the market. Interviews were conducted with a pre-written guide with questions relating to different topics. The aim of semi-structured interviews is to gain an insight into the interviewee's own experiences and perceptions of a certain phenomenon (Bryman, 2016) This is done by keeping to open-ended questions and staying attentive to interviewees responses (ibid.). By keeping to a flexible form my interviewees were allowed to expand and delve into topics which were important to them. During my interviews, it was not uncommon for the conversation to take an unexpected turn which would provide a new perspective to my research.

Conducting the interviews with a translator posed some difficulties. Often the interviews would need to be paused for clearing out misunderstandings. When the conversation circled around topics of specific interest to my study, I would often ask my informant to explain and clarify their statements several times. This was not so time efficient, but I prioritized coming as close as possible to what they meant. Though these discussions provided valuable information, it made the interviews unsuitable for citations. Therefore, most of the citations presented in my findings come from the focus group discussions, while information from interviews are presented in the text or as short stories.

During some of the interviews, I could sense how my informant did not entirely trust that I would understand what they meant. Coming from two very distinct life-worlds, an interaction of mutual trust and understanding is difficult to achieve. My assistant, a very warm and friendly Nyakyusan woman, was probably to great help in this case. Although, because of this I made sure to focus some of the questions where I could sense the women were not entirely outspoken (questions concerning their husband, marriage, and the society's opinions about market women) to the focus group discussions instead of the individual interviews. For this reason, I also chose to increase the number of focus groups initially planned.

Four focus group discussion were conducted. The first one was held with seven women sellers from the market. The participating women sold different crops and consisted of a variation in income and age. The discussion was facilitated by my assistant. She was informed about the aims of the focus group and asked follow-up questions and encouraged the women to tell about their own experiences. The focus of this group discussion was issues relating to being a woman and entrepreneur at the market. A second focus group was held the next week, divided into separate groups of men, women and youth. Six women attended, nine men and seven young girls and boys. The group was divided into three to avoid that women and youth would not feel comfortable to express their opinion. The focus of these discussions was to trace gender norms in the community and the participants needed not themselves be sellers at the market, only be residents of Kiwira ward. Two of these groups were facilitated by my assistant and a third by me together with a bachelor graduate, Assa Mwakalebela, who translated.

The focus group discussions provided another type of empirical data than the individual interviews. While the individual interviews circled around the women's own lives and practical day-to-day activities, the focus group discussion treated questions of gender norms, ideals and morals. Using focus group discussions, the social and interactional aspects of the discussion must be taken into consideration (Silverman, 2015). The focus group with men, one which will often be quoted in this thesis, can be taken as an example. Firstly, the men often discussed in general terms (a general marriage, a general division of labor etc) which might not reflect the actual arrangements within *their* family. Second, the statements were expressed in a group, where issues of what is considered normal and masculine might affect the discussions. Therefore, rather than taking the answers from focus groups as reports of actual practices, an analysis which is closer to discourse

analysis has been of use (Silverman, 2015), where the logic behind certain statements concerning gender relations can be traced.

Throughout the three weeks spent at the market, constant ethnographic observations were made. I kept a notebook which I would write in whenever I got the time, and at the end of every day I wrote down my overall impressions. Each day spent at the market included some casual conversations with people we met. The rain season meant a daily afternoon rain which usually got us caught under the roof of the market just as we were to take the bus home. Standing squeezed together under the roof with hundreds of sellers often led to conversations. The interviews with saleswomen were conducted at their respective spot, which meant that we sometimes needed to pause as customers came by. Though sometimes disturbing, this also offered a chance to see the interactions between sellers and customers. During the last week of fieldwork, I followed one of my informants, Neema, in her daily activities for 12 hours. I followed her back from the market to her home, spent the night there and joined her to the market early the next morning. Neema is a cabbage saleswoman who lives with her husband and children on a small farm outside of Kiwira, who reported a middle range income from the market. Through following her to her home I could see how she and her family lived, her daily life and activities, and I got the chance to see how she bought her cabbage at the wholesale which takes place before sunrise at the marketplace.

Table 1. *Overview of women interviewed.*

NAME	AGE	CROP(S)	PROFIT/WEEK TZH¹	MARI- TAL STA- TUS
GRACE	50	Beans and peas	15-40 000	Widowed
SOPHIA	23	Tomatoes	10-15 000	Married
VALERIA	46	Rice	-	Widowed
JOSE- PHINE	35	Potato	-	Married
JANETH	26	Onion	5-20 000	Married
MWAJUMA	Over 70	Tomatoes and other vegetables	-	Widowed
ELIZA- BETH	51	Maize	-	Married
DOREEN	29	Leafy greens	50-125 000	Married
BETTY	58	Peanuts	-	Widowed
EUNICE	Over 60	Peanuts	-	Married
SHARON	41	Beans	-	Married
NEEMA	40	Cabbage	20 000	Married

¹ Not all women wanted to tell their weekly earnings.
10 000 TZH is approximately 4 USD

RACHEL	33	Ambulent seller, banana and passion-friut	15- 20 000	Married
EDINA	29	Ambulent seller, avocado and yams	10-30 000	Married
BAHATI	45	Maize and other grains	-	Married
GETRUDA	54	Fish	70 000	Married (husband living in another district)
AGNESS	49	Avocado and other vegetables	15-20 000	Separated

1.2.2 Considerations

Conducting qualitative research in a foreign culture requires a couple of considerations and clarifications (Creswell, 2014). First of all, as a researcher, my role in this study is not invisible. As a Swedish academic feminist, the study will be influenced by my understanding of gender equality which is formed in a Scandinavian discourse and by mainly Western feminist theory. To counteract this, I have during interviews and focus group discussions aimed to remain open and responsive to subjects which engage my informants. Though, ultimately, the resulting focus of the study is a combination of mine and my informants' approach to the subject (Davies, 2008). Secondly, it is important to note that the power relations which exist between me as a researcher and my informants might affect their answers and make them hesitant to speak openly or make them want to answer what they think I want to hear. Also, due to translation, quotes from interviewees are not in their exact words. Lastly, conducting research in a culture to which one is unknown requires efforts to ensure validity since one lacks the culture-sensitivity needed to interpret properly. In this study, my research assistant Kissa has been of most importance for my interpretations. Statements from interviews and focus group discussion were discussed thoroughly afterwards and as we would eat dinner together every evening, we would often take the opportunity to discuss topics which we had encountered during the day. As my research assistant was of Nyakyusan ethnicity as most of my market women informants, she could relate many of their experiences to her own life. However, unlike my informants she had grown up in Dar Es Salaam and underwent education up to master's degree, which might influence also her interpretation of the interviewees' statements. Other ways of ensuring validity have been to confront my key-informants with some of my analyses and to triangulate between individual interviews, focus group discussions and observations of how people behave (Creswell, 2014). Despite the risk of misinterpretations that the meeting with a new culture entails, being an outsider to a culture also allows for observations otherwise impossible (Robben, 2012). As an outsider

observant it is possible to notice unique aspects of a culture which to those brought up in it would be considered unimportant, ordinary and most natural.

1.3 Theoretical background

1.3.1 Capitals of importance at the marketplace

Central for Bourdieu's theories and his descriptions of how the social world is reproduced and power is distributed are his concepts *habitus*, *capitals* and *fields* (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). With the habitus, and its relation to fields, Bourdieu aims to overcome the dichotomy of agency versus structure. The *habitus* refers to our natural way of acting (walking, eating, speaking etc.), our skills and dispositions- all acquired through the environment in which we are brought up. In other words, the habitus is social and cultural norms internalized in our bodies. Through our habitus and our upbringing in different environments we possess different capitals. Examples of capitals in Bourdieu's theories are financial capital, cultural capital, social capital and symbolic capital. These capitals come to use when we find ourselves in a certain field of action. *Fields* are different subject arenas of society which Bourdieu often explain through the metaphor of a game. Each field has its own 'game' which the participating agents are aiming to 'win' i.e. gain important resources from. The capitals which agents possess are used as valuable 'playing cards', and have different value depending on which field they are used in. In that way, within different social fields, our collection of capitals will be relatively useful, and might or might not entail us with benefits. While financial capital is the most valuable capital in most fields, there are fields in which another type of capital can trump financial. In the case of the field of art for example, cultural capital is more desirable than financial.

In my study, the capitals of most importance are financial capital, social capital and to some extent symbolic capital. Financial capital I believe needs no further explanation. Social capital is the network of family, friends and acquaintances, which can be used to gain certain resources. Any capital can be used as a symbolic capital where this is translated into honor, prestige or recognition (Bourdieu, 1986). Bourdieu writes that symbolic capital is "the acquisition of a reputation for competence and an image of respectability and honorability..." (1984, p. 291). There is much evidence on the importance of social capital in informal settings (Meagher, 2005), and the market of Kiwira is no exception. As mentioned, the Kiwira market is not to be considered informal according to all definitions, but it shares many of the characteristics ascribed to informal markets. Portes (2010) writes that in contrast to what one may think of informal markets, it is not an arena that -because of its lack of regulations- is the quintessential of pure competition. Rather, the lack of regulations and the insecurity that it leads to increases the risk of fraud and thus encourages actors to instead rely on strong social ties based on trust (Portes, 2010). As with any capital, social capital is not simply something that

is given but requires constant work for its maintenance and accumulation. Gaining social capital hence requires investment of labor-time. One type of capital can be transferred to another, although also this process requires labor-time and a risk of loss of capital. Social capital can be transferred to economic capital, for example by taking a loan from a relative. Equally, economic capital can be transferred to social capital, for example by helping somebody out when they face an economic shortage (Bourdieu, 1986). There are several mechanisms which ensure the value of social capital. One is reciprocity, where an act of kindness is expected to be repaid, however there is no certainty in *when* this is to happen. Another mechanism is the security that can appear in tight-knit groups, where donations within the group is secured-not by knowledge of the recipient- but by the group's ability to sanction members that do not behave in the interest of the group (Portes, 2010). A fundamental difference between social capital and financial capital is that social capital is within reach for everyone. This makes it one of the means through which dominated groups can resist oppression from dominant groups (Portes, 2010).

1.3.2 Doing gender- masculinities/femininities, institutions and mobilities

In Bourdieu's analyze of the Kabyle society in *Masculine Domination* (2001) he describes the men's domination over women that takes place as a process in which the society is divided into distinct social spheres as either masculine or feminine, and the feminine is made subordinate to the masculine. Separated practices taking place in separated spheres create feminine and masculine dispositions. When these dispositions become essentialized-seen as reflecting the different natures of men and women- the system of separation and the domination of women becomes legitimized and perceived as natural. This description of the workings of gender inequality is similar to those of many feminist scholars before him. West and Zimmerman (1987) write that the upholding of masculine domination is possible when there are institutions that emphasize the difference between men and women and when this division then is made legitimate through interaction. They write: "Doing gender means creating differences between girls and boys and women and men, differences that are not natural, essential, or biological. Once the differences have been constructed, they are used to reinforce the "essentialness" of gender" (1987, p. 137).

These understandings of gender are based on the idea that gender is reproduced at the level of action and interaction, meaning that gender power relations in a society require the constant reproduction of it through its agents. This view is captured in Bourdieu's use of practices and West and Zimmerman's idea of 'doing gender'. This view can be contrasted to the theory of sex roles (or gender roles), which by many feminists now is seen as outdated (Connell, 1985; Acker, 1992; West & Zimmerman, 1987). Though role theory emphasizes the social construction of gender and encompasses the socialization of boys and girls and the differentiated activities of men and women, it lacks a discussion on how this is played out in everyday life and equally how roles can change over time (Connell, 1985). The idea of

how gender is ‘done’ through practices will hence be guiding my understanding in this thesis.

Certain practices are standardized into *institutions* which hold a high level of legitimacy. Institutions can be both formal and informal and refer to widespread phenomena such as the family, legal systems, traditions and rites etc. (Portes, 2010) Acker (1992) advocates the view of gender as an organizing principle, meaning gender is part of every institution in society. Gender is both constitutive of institutions and further enforced through them (Portes, 2010). While institutions can be changed on surface level, for example as new laws or policies are implemented, the deep values which they are based on are often resistant to change. This can create a situation where how things are *supposed* to be, on paper, is not how things are *in reality* (ibid.)

Accomplishing gender is often so routinized that we do it effortlessly (West & Zimmerman, 1987). However, some situations make the accomplishment of gender more difficult, as being a woman conducting an activity normally ascribed as masculine. This puts the ‘accomplishment’ to test, and women have various strategies for succeeding (ibid.). West and Zimmerman state that we are at all times accountable for our accomplishment of gender. This means that we can be questioned on our ability to properly ‘do’ our gender. As they note, “if we fail to do gender appropriately, we as individuals-not the institutional arrangements-may be called to account (for our character, motives, and predispositions).” (ibid. p 146). Failing to accomplish a feminine gender is hence connected to stigmatization and might lead to being labeled a ‘bad woman’. This logic applies to men as well. Not accomplishing a masculine gender might lead to one being considered not a ‘proper man’. Hence, men are not unaffected by gender norms, neither is their domination a purely conscious act. West and Zimmerman (1987) note that as we do gender, we do not only constitute ourselves as either men or women, men accordingly do domination and women do subordination. ‘Doing’ domination is hence part of men’s accomplishment of gender.

An important part of constituting ourselves as either masculine or feminine are our movements. In *Masculine Domination*, Bourdieu (2001) notes not only the importance of how men and women in the Kabyle society move (body posture etc.) but also when and where. Bourdieu describes in detail men and women’s differentiated movements throughout the day and how these coincide with gender norms in the society (Bourdieu, 2001). Our unreflected and gendered movements are indeed part of what he calls the *doxa*- the unmentioned and hence unquestioned aspects of a culture (Bourdieu, 1977). In the anthology *Gendered Mobilities*, Uteng and Cresswell (2008) write that “there are many ways in which gender is spatially produced” (p.2) and that “narratives of mobility and immobility play a central role in the constitution of gender as a social and cultural construct” (p.2). While the term *mobility* has been used in many different disciplines and for different purposes I will in this thesis refer to it as women’s spatial mobility, in other words women’s freedom of movement. In her study on market women in Benin, Mandel (2004) finds that the women’s mobility is one of the most important factors for

their profit as it determines where they can buy their inputs and hence the purchasing-price they get. However, many of the women's mobility is limited by time-consuming household duties, transport costs and by societal gender norms (ibid.). Porter (2011) found in her study on women and girl's mobility in Sub-Saharan Africa that women's mobility often is affected by a patriarchal discourse which links women's mobility to promiscuity.

1.3.3 Reproduction or change of gender relations? - Symbolic violence and doxa/heterodoxy

In Bourdieu's analysis of the Kabyle society, he finds that the masculine domination is maintained through the process of *symbolic violence*. It is "a violence which is exercised upon a social agent with his or her complicity" (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p.167). The domination is by the dominated accepted as natural through the internalization of the ideas that tend to subordinate them. It is symbolic in that it is achieved primarily without overt and explicit acts of violence or coercion. The ideas that are accepted as natural is what Bourdieu calls *doxa*, elements seeming so natural of a culture that they do not need to be mentioned (Bourdieu, 2001). In a situation of doxic gender relations, the domination is not recognized by the women, because it is *misrecognized* as the natural order of things. Power relations are hidden and seen "not for what they objectively are but in the form which renders them legitimate in the eyes of the beholder" (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977). When using the concept symbolic violence, I find it necessary to note, as Durey (2008) does, that the domination must not *per se* be misrecognized by the women. The concept is useful for seeing the reproductive mechanisms of gender, but it does not go into detail about the women's complicity. It may well be that they recognize the symbolic violence that is exercised towards them, but they may for various reasons choose not to resist. It may be that they feel powerless or because of the enormous effort it would take to go against what is seen by others as natural. It may also be that what they stand to lose if they do not conform to the pertaining gender relations does not give them incentive to resist. Equally, accepting the conditions placed upon them and being the 'good woman' and the 'good wife' is a way of achieving social status (Durey, 2008). In this thesis, I will use the concept of symbolic violence and misrecognition to analyze the reproduction of gender relations which constrain women in their business, especially when it comes to their mobility.

The concept of symbolic violence is used to analyze how unequal gender relations are reproduced. But what about change? Feminist have argued for the need of a gender theory capable of tracing and explaining the mechanisms of change in gender relations. Moi (1991) develops Bourdieu's theories about *doxa*, *heterodoxy* and *orthodoxy* to this end. While doxa is what goes unmentioned in a culture and hence is not part of our discursive consciousness, heterodoxy refers to a situation where things are brought up to light and to discussion. Those in a dominated position have an interest in keeping a doxa in place, but when the doxa has turned into a heterodoxy it can only be replaced by the much less effective *orthodoxy*- an

attempt to defend what was once seen as natural (Bourdieu, 1977). As Moi writes, “to defend the ‘natural’ is necessarily to admit that it is no longer self-evident” (1991, p.1026). The doxa is broken when the reality that agents experience no longer aligns with what in society is perceived as ‘the natural’. When this happens, the arbitrariness of what is considered as natural is revealed and the world no longer appears as self-evident (Bourdieu, 1977). However, this experience -by Bourdieu called ‘crisis’- is only effective in breaking the doxa when it is placed within a discourse or a context (ibid.). Lovell (2003) develops this line of thought when she assesses the theories of Bourdieu versus Butler in explaining the iconic events following Rosa Parks’ protest against the segregation on buses. Lovell finds that while Butlers theories give weight to Parks’ isolated action, Bourdieu’s theories succeed in explaining how her action was part of the larger discourse of the civil rights movements and how her action was made iconic by efforts of the movement. While Bourdieu’s (2001) inferences in *Masculine Domination* are quite pessimistic about the possibilities of change of doxic gender relations, (Moi 1991) provides a different image. She claims that in the contemporary world, gender relations are most often not entirely doxic, but rather in a state of heterodoxy. This because the many experiences of women taking part in the labor economy and other masculine coded fields, but also because of their ability to place these experiences in a feminist discourse. Moi notes however, that this should not be taken as if social change is happening in all social fields, some are indeed characterized by doxa (Moi, 1991). With this in mind, and by using doxa, heterodoxy and orthodoxy, I will analyze evidence of processes of change in gender relations in and around Kiwira.

2 Findings

Walking through the Kiwira market, there is much to lay your eyes on. So many activities take place, it is impossible to grasp everything at once. Women selling vegetables on plastic covers on the ground, with babies under umbrellas for protection from the sun, older children running errands, deliveries being made, auctions taking place. And if you concentrate too much on what others do, you run the risk of bumping into somebody carrying a heavy load of products, or stepping on somebody's vegetables or dried beans on the ground. The diversity of products sold is big, with each product taking up their own section of the market. On the dirt ground there are sellers of vegetables and fruit. Some have specialized in keeping to one crop, such as cabbage, tomatoes or pineapple. Others sell a little of everything. On the elevated floor, the middle section, covered by a roof, is where the sale of rice, groundnuts, dried beans and fish takes place. There are few men at the marketplace, however they exist. They seem to mostly be found on this elevated platform, or on the ground floor selling palm oil in reused soda bottles. Why is the marketplace dominated by women? What lies behind the choice of product to sell, and how has this gendered pattern of products come to be?

Selling at the food market is undoubtedly feminine coded. Among the villagers around Kiwira, it is common that the husband works as a farmer while the woman does business at the food market. While there is a considerable amount of men owning shops outside the food market, or selling secondhand clothes on the market day, the majority of the sellers inside the food market are women. When discussing with the men at the focus group they explain that,

...a woman can go to find tomatoes of capital for 2000 [appr. 1\$] and go to sell in the market but me, an adult man, can I go to find tomatoes of 2000 and start to sell? No.

(man at focus group)

According to one of my woman informants, people think *that a man cannot come and do a business with dusty, dusty things*, which suggests that market-sale of food products among the dust of dried beans, rice and maize is not worthy for a man. So, while doing business in the food sector is an obvious choice of many women in Kiwira, it is less obvious for men. Talking to the three board members, I wonder which products are the most profitable. They tell me that one cannot say that any product is more profitable than another, it depends on the season and the number

of sellers engaged. However, they do say that some of products are more capital-intensive and hence are more difficult to start with, while others are very easy to start with. Those mentioned as capital-intensive are groundnuts, rice, beans, fish and wheat. Those which are easy to start selling are different kinds of vegetables and fruits. Another reason that the first group is more difficult to start with is because they might require traveling, something which the Chairman of the board says may be difficult for women.

The Traders Union was started in 2012 in order to organize the sellers, both to avoid conflicts and to form a stronger voice towards the local government that runs the market. The Chairperson -a man- and the Vice Chairperson – a woman- were chosen as leaders through votes from the sellers. They are the leaders of the board which consists of three representatives from each line of product, making a board of approximately 80 members. Except from negotiating with the local government, the board members are available for conflict resolution between sellers on the market days. Because the work of both Chairperson, Vice Chairperson and board members is unpaid, they do this while simultaneously selling themselves. Conflicts between sellers seems to be a common problem, as many of my informants mention this as a challenge in their business. For the sellers, to be able to cooperate with others is very important, as the relations they make give them many benefits.

The findings of this study are divided into three parts. The first will investigate the linkages between financial capital, gender and women who earn money. The second will go into questions concerning women's mobility and travels within the business. The third will show how women use their social capital at the marketplace.

2.1 Gender and financial capital in Rungwe

2.1.1 Access to financial capital- institutions and practices

Most of my women seller informants mention financial capital as their main challenge. Many have a dream of trading in larger quantities, those who are not engaged in wholesale often express a wish to do so. What is stopping them, though, is a lack of capital. Although capital is a constraint for anyone trading at the market, some factors make it more challenging for women to access money for investments in their business. One such factor is the institutional environment concerning marriage, land ownership and inheritance. I will illustrate this with a story told by one of my informants, Grace. It was during an interview which I held on a Monday, the day before one of the market days. The market area is quiet and empty, except for some cleaners removing the pile of vegetable waste in the corner

of the market, and some women preparing their avocado sale for the next day. We sit on the empty concrete floor of the market, under the big tin roof, on two small benches that we have brought out for this purpose. We start the interview by discussing the history of the market, as she is one of my informants who has been selling there the longest- over twenty years- she has experienced many of the changes that have taken place. She mentions that she is a widow, and when I ask her what happened after her husband died, she tells me this story.

Grace started her business in 1989, selling beans and green peas. For her, being brought up in Rungwe, the decision to start a business at the market came as a natural decision, “for the people of Rungwe, you cannot just sit without doing some kind of business”, she says. She was married to her husband since 1984 and together they had gotten four children, but in 1997 he died. After that, she got into a conflict with her husband’s relatives. They wanted her to be ‘inherited’. This is a custom not uncommon in Tanzania² and refers to a widow being remarried into the family to one of the husband’s male relatives. Grace’s relatives-in-law wanted her to remarry her late husband’s cousin. This was a condition for her to be able to keep the land and her house. As most women in the area, she had moved to her husband’s family’s area when she got married, and they had been given a piece of land by his parents where they had built their own house. When Grace refused to remarry her husband’s cousin, they took her to the police station. However, once there, the police officer told the relatives that it was Grace’s right to not remarry if she did not want to. This, Grace says, scared the relatives off a bit and it gave her the courage to tell them “You can take the land that was given to us, but I will keep the house that my husband and I built”. For ten years, the land was used by her relatives-in-law, while she and her children lived in the house and used the small plot around it for farming. This period of time, she says, was very tough for her. She had lost both her husband and her land, and because of this her business was suffering. Then in 2007, the elders of the village came to her house, saying that since the land was once given to her, she should be able to keep it. They invited Grace and her relatives-in-law to a meeting to discuss the matter, and after a time, the land was given back to her.

This story is unique, at the same time it is telling for the situation of women concerning access to land. Though, according to formal law, women have the right to own and inherit land, in practice it is rarely the case. Women commonly gain access to land through either their father, while they live at home, or through their husband, once they get married. The patrilocal system- meaning that the woman moves to the area of her husband- is part in creating limited access to land for women. Women usually do not inherit land from their parents because they know that once she gets married, she will move away to another area (Duncan, 2014). While formal Tanzanian law prohibits discrimination against women in land ownership, inheritance is still most often governed by customary law. The customary law is based on a long tradition of practices which is considered legitimate in most patrilineal communities in Tanzania (ibid.) Grace’s story shows how local

² Habiba 2017

institutions such as ‘wife inheritance’ hold a higher legitimacy than formal law. They are legitimate because they align with deeply held values (Portes, 2010) of keeping land within the family or the clan according to a patrilineal system (Duncan, 2014). Grace’s relatives-in-law were even so convinced of their rights to the land that they took her to the police. In the end, Grace got her land back through another informal institution, the village elders. This further shows the legitimacy of informal institutions in this rural area. Grace is not the only one of my informants to tell such a story. A widowed, peanut-selling woman told me that when her husband died, she took her children and left to go and live at her parent’s place. They wanted her to be ‘inherited’ and because of this she fled and did not put any claim to either her land or her house. Gender is clearly an integral part of the institutions organizing land ownership (Acker, 1992). For women these institutions have the material consequences of loss of land and property for women, but also the symbolic consequence of establishing a woman as always dependent on a man for her well-being, be it her father or her husband (Acker, 1992). Of my women informants, most of them use land which is written on the names of their husbands. A few report of having written both of the spouses name onto land which has been bought collectively, after the time of marriage. However, among all, land which is inherited on the side of the husband is written on the husband’s name only. The institutions guiding land ownership in Kiwira deny women the possibility of using land and property as mortgage for a loan, as well as make them dependent on men which might decrease their will to protest against patriarchal ideas.

The handling of money as a masculine practice is another factor which limits women’s access to financial capital. While some report of sharing incomes and expenditure decisions with their husband, many hand over the profit that they make to their husband. One of my informants, Rachel, says that if she wants to use her profit to invest back into her business, she must ask her husband first. Because of this situation, many women say that they hide parts of their incomes in order to remain in control over it. When this topic is discussed at the focus group, one woman says,

I cannot show the money that I make to my husband. It is better that my children eat and are full than giving it to my husband.

(woman at focus group)

Another factor which makes it difficult for women to save money is what they explain as their economic responsibility for household expenses. A majority of my women informants see themselves as responsible for providing a reliable and regular source of income to ensure the well-being of their family members. During an interview with the leader of the Trade Union, the Vice Chairwoman of the board says this makes it difficult for women to save money for their business.

Me: Do you see different challenges for women and men who sell at the market?

Vice Chairwoman: Women are the ones who mostly do business, who become successful, they are the ones who take care of the family, are the ones who build houses, who pay for school fees. But the challenge is the capital. Yes, the biggest challenge is capital. Even if they can take a loan from an institute, it is high interest.

Me: Do you mean that capital is more challenging for women?

Vice Chairwoman: Yes!

Chairman: But capital is a challenge for men also!

Me: Yes of course. Why is it more challenging for women?

Vice Chairwoman: Because the mother, a woman, has many responsibilities in the household. If you have a lot of capital, yes you can invest and become successful. But if you have a low capital, you will need all that money to feed your family.

While most of my women informants see themselves as responsible for feeding the family, the men I have spoken with say that the income to the family is the husband's responsibility. It seems this question is one of different opinions, which I will go further into below.

2.1.2 Competing truths- who is the breadwinner of the family?

One of the topics discussed at the focus group for men is gender relations in the household and the division of responsibilities within the marriage. They stated that the man is the one who is supposed to be the main income-bringer of the family. It was obvious in their statements that they felt this was what was expected by them in the society.

Primarily the one who is supposed to provide income for the household is the man, for the protection and the dignity of the family. If a man is not the main income provider of the budget for the household, even the society will say he is avoiding his responsibilities.

(man at focus group)

To be the breadwinner in Kiwira is part of performing a masculine responsibility and thus reproducing one's masculinity. From the interviews and focus groups, some purchases can also be distinguished as feminine coded and some as masculine coded. Land, the building of houses, and cattle were often referred to as men's responsibility while food, plates and dishes, clothes and other things for the children were referred to as purchases that women make. According to the men, the woman's contribution to the household economy should be seen as 'a favor' or 'a help'. One man says *the woman's income, it doesn't have a task*, indicating that it is not so important. Often, the situation for women who sell at the market is described as an exception to the rule. It is explained that a woman might start to earn an income if the husband is sick, or if she has an irresponsible husband who does not bring money to the family. A couple of men also say that women mostly use

their money to buy 'luxury goods' such as soap, skin oil, fancy fabric and new hairstyles.

Simultaneously, a contradictory picture exists. Most of the women which I spoke with claim that they are responsible for the well-being of the family, and with this comes the responsibility of ensuring a steady income for the purchase of food and other daily needs. Several women told me that when their children needed something, they would ask them for money, and not their fathers. A couple of women also report of paying for expenses that are masculine coded, such as cattle, building material and land. Some of the discrepancy between what the men say and what the women say might be explained by the two very different situations where this material was obtained. While many of the statements I got from women were from individual interviews, the men were gathered to a focus group discussion. The interviews were focused on the women's own lives, and we discussed many practical aspects of life in Rungwe. During the focus group with the men, the answers were more of a general character. It was only sometimes that they referred to their own life. In that way, the focus group might represent normative ideas about family life and gender in Rungwe, while stories from interviews show actual practical arrangements. In that view, it is obvious that the reality is far from the norm when it comes to masculine and feminine practices.

Among the women sellers whom I interviewed, many had a husband who was engaged in agriculture. This results in many households where the woman is the one who obtains most of the cash income. While most of my informants were outspoken with this situation, one elderly woman was reluctant to discuss the outcomes of this. She herself was selling peanuts at the market, while her husband was farming mostly for subsistence. I asked her if it was so that she was the one who mostly provided cash income to the household, but she only answered, *No, my husband is. The man is the provider of a household.* When I asked how, she did not want to discuss this further, but simply repeated what she had said. This shows how the discrepancy between the norm and the reality of people's lives in Rungwe can cause contention concerning femininity and masculinity. Her unwillingness to discuss this matter was probably an attempt to spare the masculinity and hence the dignity of her husband. In most other cases, however, the women proudly talked of their contributions to their household. To them, there seems to be no contradiction between a feminine gender and doing business. Often, when I asked women why they had started their business, they would seem surprised that I would ask. *To get money for living of course*, was a common response. As Grace says and I have quoted above, for a woman born in Rungwe, it is an obvious choice to start a business as a seller of food products. At the focus group, one woman makes this clear.

In this generation, if you are a woman and you are not doing anything, we are going to wonder about you. We will see you as mentally disabled. Women should do business in order to meet needs of her children and family.

(woman at focus group)

These profoundly different views on gender and breadwinning point to a situation of heterodoxy rather than doxa. Though the norm is still for a man to be the main breadwinner of the family, this norm is not uncontested. There is a vivid discussion about the issue of women earning money and what men and women's respective responsibility in the household is. Among the women, there is a shared view that they carry the primary responsibility for providing basic needs for the household, something they express explicitly. The men at the focus group on the other hand speak of the norm of the man as provider for the household. One man, though, disagrees and opens up for other possibilities. He says,

Me, I have to oppose, because we as Nyakyusa men, we have this expression: piga maji, watoto wanajua mama yao [translates: drink beer, the children know their mother]. In some families, the man is a drunk and doesn't care about the children, and the woman is the one doing business -selling banana or any crop- in order to have food in the house for the children to eat. There are different families who live differently, in one family the man pays for development issues in the house, in another family a woman is the one who pays for everything in the house.

(man at focus group)

In terms of women making an income, Kiwira is a unique case in the surrounding area. The market provides many business opportunities which are feminine coded, and not desirable for most men. This situation is likely to affect the gender relations locally. In an unpublished study conducted in Kyela, the district just south of Rungwe, inhabitants had expressed that the women there were not as the women in Tukumyu, meaning not as free and disobedient (Augustsson, 2019). The rumor which I had heard before arrival -that women from Tukumyu were aggressive saleswomen- also shows that the women's business activities in Kiwira stand out from the norm in the surrounding areas. Several of my women informants also connected their choice to be businesswomen to their upbringing in Rungwe. Rungwe women evidently have a certain connotation, which is likely to have its background in the number of women in the district involved as traders at the market. Though the responsibility for the well-being of the family is a burden which might affect their business negatively, it is also a source of pride and increased sense of agency. Most of the women say that as they started earning their own money, they feel a bigger capacity to make decisions in their household. Martha, an ambulant seller of fruit, tells me that since she started earning money in her business, she can make more independent decisions about household expenses. As an example, she says that she now pays for tuition for her child, and this she decided to do without asking her husband first. The women's experiences and changed gender practices form a basis to contest the doxa of men as the income-earners of the household. According to Moi, women's participation on the labor market and other masculine arenas in the west, together with the existence of a feminist discourse, has led to a situation of heterodoxy rather than doxa (Moi, 1991). It seems that this is happening also in Kiwira. The number of women engaged as sellers at the Kiwira market has led to a shared experience of both managing a business away from the home and being income providers to the household. This shared experience has broken the legitimacy of the doxa and paved way for a discourse of

resistance, where women's capabilities and contributions to the household are made visible. As there is no longer a doxa concerning who should be responsible for what in the household, those who have an interest in upholding it take to expressions of orthodoxy- an attempt to defend what was once considered self-evident (Bourdieu, 1977). While the men in general are not opposed to women earning small amounts of money, they warn of what happens when a woman starts earning much, or even more than her husband. At the focus group, two men say the following,

Me: Are there any changes if a woman starts to earn an income?

Man 1: When a woman starts to get money or earn income, you will see she begins to act disrespectful in the house. She starts to change the time of coming back home, the clothes she wears, the way she talks, and even the kind of skin oil she uses.

Me: Is it good for the household if the woman has an income?

Man 2: It is good, but if they do it too much, they don't get time to prepare the meals for the family. We have a lot of crops here in the district, but because women don't have time to prepare food for the children, children's nutrition has declined.

The critical discourse concerning women who earn money becomes especially visible in two common topics of discussion in Kiwira; the discussion on separation and that of women acting *kiburi*.

Discussions on separation

The heterodoxy concerning women as income-bringers to the household is evident in the often-discussed topic of separation³ around Kiwira. This was a theme discussed by both men and women. One day, my assistant and I were caught under the market roof as we waited for the afternoon rain to stop. We began talking to some of the women who sat waiting for a delivery of products to sell the next day. My assistant, perhaps tired of my endless questions about men's control over women, asked them jokingly why they had the products delivered to them: why did they not travel themselves; would their husbands not allow them? One of the women answered: *Here, no man can stop his woman from doing business, because then she will separate him!* She and the other women laughed. At the focus group for women I was told a story on the same topic. One of the participants told a story about a woman who had threatened her husband with separation after he had complained that she came home late from the market. At the focus group for men, there were also discussion concerning separation, although this was not a topic which I had brought up. One man told me that if I was to do a survey of all the women sellers at the market, I would see that a majority of the women were

³ The reason that people speak of separation instead of divorce is that both marriages and separation between spouses are informally put through. A couple is considered as married if they have lived together for a longer period of time. Likewise, a separation refers to when one of the spouses leaves the other and goes to live somewhere else.

separated. Several of the men also expressed a fear that as their wife started earning a higher income, she would eventually want a separation. That separation was such a common topic of discussion surprised me as only one of the 17 saleswomen which I had interviewed said that she was separated. Additionally, taking the institutional environment concerning access to land and property mentioned above into consideration, it would still be economically unwise for many women to separate from their husbands. Rather than reflect actual circumstances, I will argue that the discussions on separation is a sign of the critical discourse which has emerged from changed gender practices. Because of the number of women engaged as sellers at the market it has also become an arena for women to meet and discuss things which were previously not up for discussion. Together they have therefore been able to start discussing- or maybe mostly joking- about the topic of separation. In the women's case it can be seen as an expression of heterodoxy, they point to the fact that a woman is no longer dependent on her man for a living. In the case of the men, their expressed concern about separation is rather an expression of orthodoxy, an attempt to defend what was previously taken for granted. The message is that if a woman is no longer dependent on her man, it will cause problems for the society and the sacredness of the marriage.

Me: Do some things change when a woman starts to earn an income?

Man: Yes, there is change. Like, the sanctity of marriage is falling. She might start to graze livestock in her parents' home, then when you start to stop her or quarrel with her, she will say maybe we should separate and then she separates you.

Kiburi- acting proud

A word I often got to here when discussing women sellers at Kiwira is *kiburi*. My translator did not find a good English word for this but explains it as being too proud for one's own good or thinking too good of oneself. This word is primarily used when discussing a woman's attitude or behavior towards her husband. Not obeying your husband is what causes the accusation of being *kiburi*. As the men express it, it is a worry that they have when their wives start to earn money, that she will become too proud and arrogant. Examples of *kiburi* behavior which the men mention is saying you are too tired to cook, not bringing the water for the husband's bath, or simply not listening to your husband. It also seems that earning more money than the husband can directly qualify a woman as *kiburi*. While discussing women who earn money, one man at the focus group for youth says,

(...) To me, in my opinion I don't like a woman to earn more income than me, because when a woman earns more income than her man, she will start acting *kiburi*. As a man you will not be able to make decisions because the woman thinks she is superior.

(young man at focus group)

Many of my women informants mention being called *kiburi*, or mention it as an opinion that some people have about market saleswomen. However, most of them do not seem to take it too seriously. At the focus group, Doreen, the busy vegetable seller, tells a story about when she used her income to buy cattle. When she

came home after buying it her husband accused her of being *kiburi*. She says she had become angry and replied, *so therefore we should sell that cattle?* She had then decided to give the cattle to her husband, so that he would not complain. *Therefore, even when a cow gives birth, the milk we sell to a shop. So now he cannot say I am kiburi, because also he has his own income from selling milk,* she says. As she says this in a focus group with women only, it cannot be assumed that she would say the same thing when discussing in the presence of men, or whether these were the exact words she said to her husband. However, expressing this within the group of women, it can be assumed that she feels rather secure around the women to say that she argued back. Another woman at the focus group says that men can no longer complain about a woman who earns income, because he eats the food and uses the soap that she has bought. The women seem to think that calling women *kiburi* is something that belong to the past. One woman says,

Those men who were saying a woman is *kiburi* when she has an income, it was more common in previous years. Now they have been educated, before education was not there, but now they have been educated.

(woman seller at focus group)

This quote clearly contests the legitimacy of the meaning of *kiburi* women, as she links the expression to men who are uneducated. As mentioned, the men are not opposed to women earning money as such. In fact, many of them say that it is good for the household if the woman also has a source of income. What they do oppose is if a woman as a consequence of her income starts changing her behavior. Earning money can hence be a feminine practice, but doing so, women still need to perform a femininity which does not threaten their husbands. When they do not -when they change their behavior- that is when they become *kiburi* in the eyes of the men. To say to a woman that she is *kiburi* is therefore a way to remind her that she is accountable for a performance of femininity which in the eyes of men is considered a 'good' woman and wife. That is: to act obedient, fulfill all the household duties without complaints and to not argue with him. Because of this, the women's skepticism to the legitimacy of the accusation is a strong case of heterodoxy. To not take this accusation seriously is to resist the meaning of what being a 'good woman' actually entails.

2.2 Gender and mobility in Rungwe

For the women sellers of Kiwira, where and how one attains the product to sell is important. The method one uses to acquire the product can have big effects on the profit of the business since the prices of products differs largely depending on where they are bought. A common way of acquiring the product is to borrow it from another seller in the morning and then, once the working-day is over, pay back the cost of it and keep whatever is left as profit. This alternative is, by my informants, considered as the least favorable as the cost of borrowing is high. Many of my informants report of having started off their business this way, when they had low financial capital, then moving on to other methods as their capital

increased. This method also has the problem that on a day with good business and many customers at the market, most sellers are unwilling to lend their products to others as they prefer to sell them themselves. Other of my informants buy their products at the marketplace. For those who can leave the household early in the morning, there is the possibility to buy from wholesalers who come to the market before dawn. There are also those who have made contact with traders who buy and transport products to them from other districts. Only two of my informants report of traveling themselves to buy products from other districts. According to them, this has many advantages. Sharon travels once every second month to buy dried beans in Mbozi, a district west of Rungwe. She says that by traveling herself to buy the product she can get a price which will give her a profit of 2000 TZH (approximately 1 USD) per tin⁴, instead of a profit of 1000 TZH per tin, which she would get if she bought the beans from wholesalers at the marketplace. Hence, through her travels, she can double her profit.

In her study from 2004, Mandel highlighted the importance of mobility for businesswomen in Benin. She noted that mobility had a greater importance for profit than the amount of start capital the women had. With the term mobility, Mandel (2004) refers to the distance a person can travel away from their home. When I use the concept, I will additionally include the amount of time a woman is allowed to spend away from the household. This in order to account for the decreased mobility that time-consuming household duties entail. As noted above, to be considered a 'good woman' or specifically a 'good wife' in Rungwe requires the fulfillment of certain tasks within the household, or otherwise the women risk being called *ki-buri* and labeled as less good women. The women whom I have interviewed display different levels of mobility. Their mobility is influenced by many different factors: age, marital status, number of children, wealth etc. One thing that they have in common, though, is that they all do spend a considerable amount of their time at the marketplace. This is not something that can be taken for granted. During my time at the market I heard stories about women who used to be sellers but had been stopped by their husbands from coming back to the market. To illustrate the different dimensions of mobility for different women I will tell the stories of two women that I met at Kiwira: Doreen and Valeria.

Doreen grew up in Kiwira ward. Her parents died when she was still young, so she was left responsible for taking care of her grandparents. To support them and herself she started selling cooked banana in a bar in Kiwira. When she was nineteen, she married her husband who is a farmer. He produces leaf vegetables and she started selling them at the marketplace. Several years later she makes a good profit from her business, now she also buys leaf vegetables from others to sell. I first met her at a focus group I held with women sellers. As she was very outspoken and told many good stories, I wanted to have a personal interview with her. But she proved almost impossible to get a hold of. Although I knew all places she used to sell at, she was never there when me and my assistant came looking for her. Her neighbor sellers would tell us that she had just run home to settle

⁴ 20 kg. Products are often measured in tins, which is a normal-sized bucket.

something. One day she had gone home to cook lunch for her children, the other day she had run home take down the laundry as it had started raining. One time when we tried to find her, we were told that she was at the farm, helping her husband with the harvest. While she was gone, her products would still be placed out in her spot, and her neighbor sellers would sell on her behalf until she was back. When we finally found her and I could have an interview with her I asked her what her days looked like. Not surprisingly, she is a very busy woman. She has five children between four and nineteen years old. On most days she gets up at five to cook breakfast for her children. After that she goes to the farm to work with her husband for a while until she leaves to go sell at the market. She stays until lunch, then she goes home to cook for her children. She comes back to the market to sell until it is time for her to go home and cook dinner. When it is high season for some of the vegetables that she and her husband grow, they go together to the marketplace at three in the morning to sell vegetables in bulk, at the wholesale taking place before dawn at the marketplace.

- -

Valeria is a successful seller of rice. I interview her in the small facility that she rents, where she can both store and sell her rice. It is located outside the main gates of the market. Although there are less customers moving around in this area, she says she is happy to have moved from the main market. She can avoid the dust and crowdedness, and she has enough regular customers who know the way to her new spot. She is one of the two women whom I have interviewed who travel in their business. She started traveling when her husband died. Before, they had managed the business together: she would sell the rice and he would travel to purchase it. During the high season, she travels twice a week to buy rice in Kyela and Usangu, two nearby districts. She says she likes the traveling; it is good for her business, " ...when traveling, you see, this is good, this is bad. And when you see it, you can ask for a discount, so it is better than calling". Traveling during the time she was married was not possible, she says. She tells me that the traveling is not good for the marriage, that is why it is easier for her than other women- as she now is a widow. During our interview, we often have to take a pause for phone calls from customers and wholesalers. Her phone is constantly ringing. She says she has not bought a smartphone; their batteries are too bad and would not survive a whole day of constant activity. The business that she operates is very important for her and her family. Because of it she can give her five children a good education, with two of them studying at university.

These two women's stories tell of different aspects of mobility in a business-woman's life. Doreen has a limited possibility of leaving her home for longer periods of time because of her household duties. She has young children, and no one else looking after them. Mandel (2004) writes of how a high financial capital can increase women's mobility by paying for someone to look after the children and the household while they are away. Some of my informants pay for a maid, and some have the luck of having a woman relative living with them who can care for the children when they are at the market. Though being busy businesswomen, the women are still expected to ensure that breakfast, lunch and dinner is served. And

if, as for Doreen, there is no other woman at home, they need to leave the market to go home and cook it. The time of coming home from the market in the evening seems to be an issue of conflict within many households. Both men and women tell of conflicts with their spouse as a result of the woman coming home late from the market. A requirement for being able to travel away from the home is also a certain amount of capital. When asking the women why they do not travel themselves to buy their products, most of them answer that they cannot afford the travel. Additionally, the high cost of traveling is not justified if one trades in small quantities. Valeria, the rice seller, is one of the informants who report the largest profit. She also trades in large quantities. This is a prerequisite for her travels. But she also tells that she only started traveling after her husband died. For her to have traveled when he was still alive is unthinkable for her. After spending three weeks at Kiwira market, I have understood that it is very uncommon for women to travel. When asking why so few women travel, the women do not have many answers. At the focus group, one woman's answer to that question is,

For most of us here in Kiwira, we don't travel in our business. For example, there is one woman here called Mama Emmy who is a major seller of maize, she just calls the supplier and they bring maize here for her.

(woman seller at focus group)

It seems that it simply is 'the order of things', -men travel and women sell. This division seems to be at a level of doxa. It is not questioned, because it is seen as the most natural thing (Bourdieu, 1977). Two of my interviewees are saleswomen of peanuts. As I had heard that this product was one of the most capital-intensive ones, I was surprised to see that none of them made large profits. As they explained it, they barely survived on their business. I ask one of them, Eunice, if peanuts is a lucrative business. She says, *maybe for those who travel, me I just use my profit for food for the children*. Just as Valeria, she used to manage her business together with her husband, with him traveling to purchase the peanuts, and her selling them on the market days. Some time ago, her husband stopped being engaged in the business, and started farming instead. My interviewee continued with the business, but she did not start to travel herself. She says that because she had never been engaged in the traveling before, she did not know how to do it. Instead she started borrowing peanuts from other sellers at the market. As we sit talking, I see a man selling peanuts across the walkway who seems interested in our conversation. When we start to discuss these sellers from which she borrows the peanuts, he approaches us and joins our discussion. He says,

We bring the peanuts here...The men are the ones who go to bring the peanuts. The women don't go traveling. Maybe only those who are not married. Us men are the ones who bring them here, and we sell in wholesale. And the women add some profit for themselves.

(man seller of peanuts)

It seems that those who travel are those who make a big profit from peanuts. And those who travel in the peanut business are men. While the women do not seem too eager to discuss traveling, the men showed to have many opinions regarding traveling women. An argument for why traveling is not suitable for women, which I heard a couple of times, has to do with women being more fragile. The argument goes that women should not have to endure the hardships of traveling: sleeping in cheap hotels, drinking unsafe water and carrying heavy loads. Another common argument is that of women as responsible for the household: if the woman leaves, who should take care of the household? A third argument which I encountered often when discussing the matter of women traveling is what is expressed in the following quote. The man selling peanuts made it clear when he joined our discussion that he did not approve of women traveling in their business. When I asked him why, he answered,

Where should the woman sleep? In the forest in Kyela? She is going to sleep with a man! Because it is very remote. She will sleep with a man.

(man seller of peanuts)

In Kiwira, the question of women's traveling is tightly connected to the issues of sexuality, dignity, pride and stigmatization. For a man, having a wife who travels might be incompatible with performing a respectable masculinity. And for women, moving around at the market, and especially traveling overnight, implies a risk of being stigmatized as an unfaithful woman. It seems that in Kiwira, there exist a patriarchal discourse, which Porter (2011) has noted in other areas of Sub-Saharan Africa, that links women's mobility to their sexual appetite. This, and the consequences it has for women's travels, will be discussed below.

2.2.1 'Good' and 'bad' women at the marketplace

The first interview I did was with a woman selling maize, beans and some other products at the old marketplace. We discussed people's opinions about women who sell at the market and she told me that the women who are not appreciated are those who do not have honest intentions when they come to the marketplace. It took me a while to understand what these intentions were, and it turned out she meant women who came with the intention of meeting other men. This struck me as odd, why would some women start selling at the marketplace in order to meet men? Is there not an easier way to do that? But after a couple of weeks spent at the market, I understood that it is a common say: that some women come to the market either to meet another man, or to sell sex. This was repeated to me several times, both in individual interviews and in the focus groups. Women are divided into the type that is honest and has good intentions, or the type that is untrustworthy and has bad intentions. The character of a woman as either good or bad is used an argument for what level of mobility she can have. At the focus group for youth, the girls and boys discussed what happens within a household when a woman wants to start selling at the market. In this discussion, the character of the woman was explained as a factor for whether the husband would approve or not. This

argument was used both by girls and boys. The two following quotes are outtakes from this discussion.

For me, I don't worry if I trust her, but if I don't trust her, I will stop her [from coming to the market] because I fear she will meet with another man who will begin to give her money.

(Young man at focus group)

The husband may start to worry, begin to not feel good, because he knows the behavior of his wife is not good. But another husband, he can feel good because he knows for sure his wife is going to do business and when she earns an income, they are going to help each other.

(Young woman at focus group)

This narrative is also used by one of the women at the focus group for sales-women, Doreen. When discussing whether having a business is bad for the marriage or not, one woman says that a woman from Rungwe would rather divorce her husband than allow being stopped from coming to the market. She then goes on to tell a story about a woman who threatened her husband with divorce when he complained to her that she came home late from the market. Doreen disagrees and says,

But if you are late, he can come and accompany you at the market. Because us, we are doing business trustfully, that is why even our husbands trust us. We are not prostitutes, that is why our husbands trust us. Even sometimes when I have to be early at the market, he will accompany me until the sun rises. (...)

(woman seller at focus group)

According to her, having a business does not cause problems for the marriages of her and her fellow sellers. Instead, the husband can be supportive and helpful in the business. This because their husbands trust them, as they are not untrustworthy prostitutes, but in fact 'good women'.

The idea of trustful or untrustful women is also used as an argument as for whether a woman should travel in the business or not. The following quote is an outtake from the focus group discussion with youths.

Me: How long can a woman go away to travel in her business?

Young man: It doesn't matter how long she is away travelling; it doesn't matter if it is for 2 day, 3 days, one week it depends on the way your live and your plans. When you know your wife and you are in good relation with her, she's supposed to give information on everything when she's traveling, when she arrives she should tell you and every day she should communicate the progress of her journey... But when the relation is not good, it means I will stop her from travelling, there will be no travelling away.

Unlike the idea of women who are *kiburi*, too proud, the idea of women who are infidel, or prostitutes, was not protested by my women trader informants. Only in the focus group with youth there were two persons who questioned this idea, one boy and one girl. Instead of making the mobility a question of the character of the woman, they discussed the character of the man. The girl says *it depends on the man, a man who doesn't understand is the one who thinks if his wife starts doing business, she might meet another man or start with prostitution*. The boy says that the men who think this way are mostly uneducated, but that nowadays things are changing. However, these two are the only ones during my time at the market who have expressed critique to the idea.

The idea that there are unfaithful women, and even prostitutes at the market, works as a powerful stigma that prevents women from questioning gender norms around traveling. Because the narrative is legitimate among both men and women, it leaves little space for expressions of a heterodox view. As West and Zimmerman write, "if we fail to do gender appropriately, we as individuals-not the institutional arrangements-may be called to account (for our character, motives, and predispositions)." (1987, p 146). The controlling of women's movement which is a consequence of this stigma is not recognized as the domination that it is, rather it is misrecognized as a question concerning the character of different women. This controlling of women is an example of how symbolic violence works to disguise the power relations and render legitimate the order of things (Bourdieu, 2001). Through the symbolic meanings of good and bad women, women's movements can be controlled without the use of coercive force or violence. The women themselves take part in their own subordination by accepting the doxa that rules some women out as 'bad women'.

It may well be that the women see the domination taking place as they are forced to accept the restrictions placed upon their movements (cf. Durey, 2008). However, because of their position they might choose not to express this fact or make any claims that contest it. It might be that they see the enormous effort it would take to go against the norm and they probably suspect that this would lead them to being labeled as one of these women with 'bad intentions'. Additionally, the men's expressions quoted above, about not letting a woman who shows bad behavior go to the market or travel, signals that the women's freedom of movement is conditioned on their behavior towards their husbands. Perhaps the women fear that if they put claims to a higher mobility or act disobediently, they might end up losing their freedom of movement altogether. Also, putting themselves in relation to these 'bad' women constitutes themselves as worthy women, which might be beneficial to them.

With this analysis, I do not mean to say that the stigma of bad women is consciously constructed by the men in order to control their wives' movements. For the men, the performance of a respectable masculinity includes having an obedient wife. Because of this, the men genuinely fear having a wife who is considered bad or unruly. One of the young men expresses this in a focus group.

Sometimes it happens that a husband and wife have a good marriage, where they compromise, but then people from outside work as a catalyst for conflict. It might be relatives or parents-in-law who say that “his wife is never at home; she is always away travelling!”

(young man at focus group)

2.3 Social capital at the marketplace

The trade taking place in Kiwira is a complex fabric of business relations. Crops sold at Kiwira come from all over the region. Traders from all over Tanzania also come to Kiwira to purchase goods to sell in the big cities, when these are in season and therefore can be found at a good price in Mbeya region. It is not uncommon for sellers to both sell directly to customers, but also lend their products at a high interest to other sellers who cannot afford to buy them. One afternoon, my assistant and I interviewed a woman who is a large trader of maize, Elizabeth. We sat together with her at her spot just on the edge of the elevated floor. She sat with her legs dangling off the edge, about one and a half meter above the dirt ground underneath us. In front of her, leaned up against the wall, an enormous pile of dried maize spread out. As we talked, she would keep a constant eye on what was going on around her pile of maize. Sometimes I could see that she was counting in her head. Beneath us, at the other end of the pile, her son and some other young men had just arrived with a small truck filled with bags of maize which they were pouring out, increasing further the size of the pile. On the right side of the pile, two men stood discussing. Suddenly one of them started filling a bucket with the maize and the other man had brought out some money. I asked my interviewee what was going on, is he selling her maize? She answered that he was selling maize for her, he would add some profit for himself to keep, and give the rest to her. I asked her why the customer would not buy directly from her and hence get a lower price. She laughed and told me that the customer had no idea that the maize was hers, he thought that the man owned it and that the price which he paid was a good price. The customer left with his bucket of maize, and Elizabeth bent forward to collect her profit from the man who had sold it.

This complex fabric of business relations requires a certain amount of trust between the parties, making social capital an invaluable asset for a trader. Social capital is important both for keeping and recruiting regular customers, as well as cooperating with fellow sellers. A high social capital also seems to be able to alleviate both a lack of financial capital and a limited mobility.

2.3.1 Seller-customer relationships

For a seller at the Kiwira market, the risk of fraud is always present. Since there are no formal contracts written between the actors of the trade (wholesellers, retailers, farmers, etc) it is difficult to take legal action in case of fraud. The lack of legal institutions to sanction misbehavior within markets of small-scale business in

Africa has been noted in other studies (Tillmar, 2016). In Kiwira, the Traders Union have sought to solve this problem by taking on the task themselves. Every Tuesday and Friday, the members of the board are available for conflict-resolution when somebody is accused of not delivering the correct amount of product, or not paying as agreed. However, this is done on a voluntary basis, and the board members do not have time to solve all conflicts. Two factors are relevant for the risk of fraud: one is the common practice of borrowing products, the other is the use of Mpesa- a system for paying over the phone. As mentioned, many sellers borrow their products from other sellers and later pay back the cost at the end of the day. The use of Mpesa is also very common. Most deliveries of products are paid in advance this way and then later delivered to the market. The system of borrowing products and paying either in advance or later through the phone, combined with a lack of systems for sanctioning, creates a situation of high risk for those involved. Because of this risk, the actors of the market often choose to work with persons whom they have known for a long time and hence trust. Portes (2010) writes that while many believe the informal market to be the 'real, pure market' of competition undisturbed by taxes and regulations, it is in fact the opposite. The insecurity that the informal market implicates increases the importance of social ties, and hence makes the economy more embedded in social networks (Portes, 2010). For my informants in Kiwira, trust is highly important and a common topic of discussion. Several of my informants mention trust as the biggest challenge in their business. One of my informants, Josephine, explains this situation well.

Josephine trades in rather big quantities of potatoes, both as retail and wholesale. For her to be able to order large deliveries of potatoes, she is firstly reliant on the payment from her biggest customers. Those customers, with which she has a long relationship, trust her enough to pay for the potatoes in advance. Some of these customers she has had for over ten years and she calls them her 'mama buyers'. Hence, her mama buyers make a big order of potatoes and send her money through Mpesa. Josephine then sends this money to a trader in another district who arranges with collecting harvested potatoes and sending these to the market. With the payment that her mama buyers send, Josephine orders a surplus of potatoes which she then sells to other smaller and irregular customers at the market. Her whole business is thus reliant on the payment in advance from her mama buyers. For this reason, Josephine is very keen to keep these customers and she puts a lot of effort into keeping them satisfied. For example, if she cannot arrange a delivery of potatoes as her mama buyer wishes, she will buy potatoes from another seller for the same price as her selling price. This will not give her any profit, but she avoids the risk of losing one of her most important customers.

Josephine's story shows just how important social capital is for a trader in Kiwira. For her mama buyer to send money for her in advance, she must trust that Josephine will bring her the potatoes as promised. Josephine in turn must trust that the trader she sends the money to will deliver the potatoes from the farm in time, or else she will lose her mama buyer's trust. All these transactions are possible because the actors know each other and have worked together for a long time. This type of trust is based on reciprocity, where an act of reliability is expected to be

repaid (Portes, 2010). Over time, a customer-seller relationship can become something more. Valeria, the rice seller, also has customers whom she has had for over ten years. She says that her relationship to those customers is very strong. They can borrow money from each other, and they can help each other out in a crisis, like the death of a relative for example. Creating that kind of inter-dependence will further strengthen the bonds of trust (Portes, 2010). However, the risk of fraud can never be avoided and many of my informants report of experiences of not being paid for their products. Especially those who lend products to other's during the market days have experiences of not being paid back at the end of the day. One seller tells me that she will not lend products again to somebody who does not pay back. When I discuss this topic with Valeria, she just shrugs her shoulders and says, *what can I do if they don't pay back? I will just hope that one day she will have money and send me the payment.* It seems that incidents like these are to be expected for a seller in Kiwira.

Josephine's story also shows the length at which sellers are willing to go to keep their regular customers. As Bourdieu writes, social capital needs to be maintained, which can require both time and money (Bourdieu, 1986). Several of my informants mention making sure to always have the product available for a regular customer. Just like Josephine, they prefer to buy from another seller at purchasing-price instead of telling the customer that they are out of the product. All of my informants also say that regular customers get some benefit, it might be either some additional product, or the possibility to pay later. Some also choose to spare the best quality products for these customers. The advantage with regular customers is that they provide a steady income for the business. My informants also explain that if you manage to always have a good quality product, a regular customer will start to buy only from you. In Josephine's case, the trust that allows her mama buyer to pay her for the potatoes in advance has become a source of credit for her. This shows one of the ways in which social capital can be transformed into financial capital (Bourdieu, 1986).

To create a steady base of customers takes a long time, and many of my informants tell of having a difficult start in their business. Since these relationships are built up over a long time, the actors of the market are vulnerable to changes. In 2018, the local government decided to build a bus station at the every-day market further down the street. Three of my informants used to sell there before but were forced to move to another spot when the construction began. They all say that they lost many customers when they had to move, because their customers can no longer find them. However, not all sellers are dependent on regular customers. A way to avoid this dependence is to be an ambulant seller outside of the market gates. The ambulant sellers have their tables close to the bus station. As a bus stops, they place their products on trays on their heads and approach the bus to sell to customers through the windows. Edina, one of the ambulant sellers, says she chose this kind of business because she did not want to sit and wait for customers to approach her. *This way, she says, you go to the customer, the customer doesn't go to you.*

2.3.2 Relationships between sellers

Many women tell of having made close friends among the other sellers. The treatment toward one another is respectful- it is not considered correct to try to steal another seller's customer. Over at the bus station, the ambulant sellers of fruit gather around the buses as these make a stop to sell to customers through the bus windows. When then the buses leave, the sellers stand chatting, holding each other's hands or hanging over their friend's shoulders. Rachel, an ambulant seller of bananas and passion fruit says that there are rules for how to behave around the bus. If you see a fellow seller in conversation with a customer, you should not go over and try to convince them to buy from you instead. Among the sellers within the market gates, to sell on another sellers account is common. If a neighbor seller needs to leave the market for some reason, the custom is to watch over her products and sell to customers who approach her spot while she is away. For some sellers, like Doreen- the busy vegetable seller- this is very important, as she often needs to leave for her home to cook or do some other household chore. Because of her helpful neighbor sellers, she can run home for a while without losing too much profit. This way, the limited mobility that she has because of her household duties is somewhat compensated.

2.3.3 Forming groups for credit

A majority of my informants are involved in small savings groups formed at the marketplace. These are locally known as *michezo* but are common throughout Tanzania under different names (Tillmar 2016). Each group has different rules but common for all is a "merry-go-round" system where the members take turn in receiving a bulk of money collected from the group. A common system is for each member to provide a certain amount, say 10 000 TZH (appr. 5 USD) every market day. This sum is collected and handed out to someone of the group according to a rotation; the next market day it is somebody else's turn to receive the bulk. Not all groups collect money regularly, some only collect money when a member is in need. In that case, there are rules for what incidents count as valid for a contribution from the group. These are often the death of a close relative, where a spouse, child, sibling or parent count, but not a cousin for example. The amount of money to contribute depends on the wealth of the members. Some groups consist of sellers with high profits, which often require larger contributions. As an example, Valeria-the rice seller- is in a group where the members contribute 30 000 TZH every market day, Tuesdays and Fridays. That makes a weekly contribution of 60 000 TZH (26 USD), which is far above what most of my informants make in one week. This group consists of 12 other sellers with high profits, most of them involved in fish or rice. Other groups have lower member contributions, some collecting 5000 TZH on a market day. A common feature though, is that the percentage of seller's profit that goes to *michezo* usually is remarkably high. Many women report of placing more than half of their earnings in their savings group. Those of my informants who are not members of such a group cannot afford to pay the contribution, a requirement to stay a member. As a newcomer to the market, becoming a member of such a group may take some time. For one of my

informants, it took her three years before she was accepted as a member of the group she wanted to join. She says she had to first prove that she was an honest and trustworthy person, and that she had a steady income, large enough to be able to pay the weekly contribution.

This saving system is a way of transforming social capital into financial capital (Bourdieu, 1986). Through *michezo*, the members can often get access to a large amount of money in less time than they would if they had been saving on their own. My interviewees say that the advantage with *michezo* is that it is easier to save money if you do not keep it at home. Giving the money to the group makes it easier not to be tempted to buy something small for it. Some of my informants also emphasize the security that comes from being part of such a group: because of the relationships you make you can get help from the other members if you face some kind of crisis. Within some of the groups, members can also borrow money from each other. Trust within the group is ensured through the membership. Groups are careful when accepting a new member, and if someone misbehaves or cannot longer afford to pay the contribution, that person will be excluded. The type of trust involved here is hence based on the groups' ability to sanction misbehavior (Portes, 2010).

2.3.4 Being 'trustworthy'

At the Kiwira market, there is much talk about being 'trustworthy'. As mentioned above, it is a requirement for being accepted into a *Michezo* group. It is also important for sellers when they choose which traders to deal with. When striving for a leader position within the organization of sellers, being considered trustworthy is key. What does it mean then, to be trustworthy? I speak with the Vice Chairwoman of the Traders Union. She has reached a position which, though not paid, is prestigious and influential. She says that what has gotten her to her position is that she has shown her 'trustworthiness'. According to her, this has been done through her many duties in the community. In her village, she is the leader of the ten-houses association⁵, she has been a member of the board for the secondary school her children go to and she has been a treasurer in several associations and projects. That way, she says, many people know of her and her trustworthiness. I ask her what it means for her to be trustworthy. She says:

To be trustworthy... as for me, when I collect the money for the secondary school or for the project, I just take that money and I bring it to the secretary, I deliver it without even touching that money. I just bring that money without rotating or investing in my business. (...) Even when I was the treasurer, I just took that money and kept it at home, I didn't use that money, although I was the one keeping it. (...) Because if you have used it and they call you and say they need the money, you cannot answer "oh, can you wait for three days?", no!

(Vice Chairwoman)

⁵ A type of village association.

A wide and well-maintained social capital can eventually become something of a symbolic capital, when one's achievements are known by many and hence turned into a favorable reputation (Bourdieu, 1986). Through her statements, it is also clear that being trustworthy is closely connected to handling money. Tanzania, being a country with widespread poverty and characterized by collectivism than individualism (Kyriacou, 2015), makes holding on to a large amount of money unreasonable. To entrust someone with the task of keeping a large amount of money in their home is thus a risk. That is why the Vice Chairwoman's flawless history of keeping money is a qualification for further assignments. In the *michezo* system, the problem of trusting somebody to keep money has been overcome by the "merry-go-round" system. The money that is collected throughout the day can immediately be given to whoever's turn it is to receive the collection. Despite this, the person with the task of collecting and handing out the money is one which is carefully chosen by the members. Even here, trustworthiness is the most often mentioned reason for choosing a certain person. People fear that between the collection and the handing out of the money, money might disappear on the way. One of my informants tell me that in their *michezo* group, they have decided to only contribute money when someone is in need, and this directly to that person. This to avoid the risk that a person assigned to collect and distribute the money acts in corrupt way.

It is feasible to assume that it is easier for a person with high financial capital to behave 'trustworthily'. Someone who is in less urgent need of financial capital might feel less tempted to use the money for short-term needs. This might be the case also when it comes to trustworthiness among sellers, customers and middlemen. For Josephine, the potato saleswoman, she needs to rely on her customers and the middlemen to pay and deliver on time. Here, controlling a large amount of money when needed might be an advantage for a reputation as trustworthy. One of my informants who sells fish is part of an *michezo* group with mainly other fish-sellers. She says that she chose to join that group because she trusts other fish-sellers. Because she knows that the fish business is a good business, she can trust that the other members can pay their fees and pay back the loans if they borrow. It seems that the more capital you are in charge of, the easier it is to be considered trustworthy. This might be a disadvantage for women, as many explain that their husbands are in control over the money that they make at the market. Hence, if they urgently need to pay back a loan, they might face difficulties doing so, and their trustworthiness might take a toll. Trustworthiness as connected to financial capital- and hence to a masculine gender- might be the explanation to why men are overrepresented in leadership positions at the market. The board of the Traders Union consists of the Chairman, the Vice Chairwoman and then three representatives from each line of products. Among the lines of product where there exist no men sellers, the representatives are of course all women. However, among the lines where men are in minority, but still exist, the representatives are men. In the businesses of peanuts, cooking oil, cabbage and fish, two or all three of the representatives are men. The exception is the rice business, where men sellers do exist, but a majority of the representatives are women. As mentioned, the reason given for choosing a certain person for a leadership position is often their

trustworthiness. If this trustworthiness is in turn connected to financial capital and hence masculinity, this could explain the underrepresentation of women in the board. However, this is probably just one of many ways in which leadership is constructed as a masculine practice. One woman whom I interviewed says that the leader of their group -the only man within their line of business- was chosen because he was 'an adult'. While most of the women sellers in the group are also to be considered adults, this shows how a masculine gender is more connected to authority and leadership.

2.3.5 Social capital, a means of resistance?

The reason for saving money through *michezo* which the women mention is that it is easier to save that way, because then it is impossible to take from the savings. However, one cannot help but wonder if this is also a way to avoid the control over money from their husbands. As mentioned previously, many women hand over the money which they earn to their men at the end of the day. If a large amount is already given away in *michezo*, this keeps it out of reach from their husbands. In a study, Tripp (1997) found that these savings groups were a way for women to increase the control over their funds. In my study, though this is not an explicit goal from my women informants, it seems to be a consequence as the men express a frustration over their decreased insight and control over the women's earnings. They say that they cannot trust if their wife is telling the truth about how much she is contributing to *michezo* and how much she gets when it is her turn to receive. The following quote illustrates this.

For example, in a big family of maybe 40 or more... if someone in your family passes away you have to take care of the funeral activities⁶. A woman might be in *michezo* and the group come to see their fellow member and contribute the money. Then the woman does not give that money which she has received for the funeral activities, she just saves it in her pocket! I never saw any woman bring that money home that she received for funeral, I didn't see any sisters or any women in my family do that.

(man at focus group)

The strong bonds of trust and the solidarity created between women (and some men) sellers at the marketplace poses a threat to the husbands' authority. At the marketplace, the women can independently choose to place their money in different *michezos*. Bourdieu writes that the dominating groups in a certain field of action always face the risk of misappropriation of capitals by the dominated groups (1986). If the women choose to place their money in *michezo* partly because of this reason, this can be seen as a type of resistance through misappropriation of capitals.

⁶ Arranging a funeral is expensive and a cost can come unexpectedly, why many women engage in *michezo* for funeral expenses. When arranging a funeral, the relatives are expected to cook nice food (often meat) for the many guests that arrive.

The men are also suspicious of the *michezos* that their wives join because of another reason, the influence which other women might have on their wife. One of the men at the focus group expresses this suspicion,

Me: What does a husband think when his wife starts selling at the market?

Man: You should look at who gave her the idea of starting a business, what is the behavior of that woman, is she married or not? Because nowadays women want to be free! We are worried! We look at which group she joins at the market, because their behavior is known.

A woman's movement from the household out to the public area of the market implicates a meeting with various ways of life. This eye-opening experience can form the first step of breaking down doxic gender relations. As women then form relationships outside of their household and together can discuss matters that concern them, the doxa is certainly threatened. Several men at the focus group express the worry that a woman might get new ideas when she starts selling at the market. One man says,

(...) Sometimes she can bring new rules to the marriage, after seeing what another woman does. Rules that are different from the agreement which was made at the time they got married.

(man at focus group)

This quote clearly shows the fear of disruptions to the status quo. It also shows the insight to what might happen when women meet and start to discuss. As Bourdieu writes, the means of resistance for dominated groups- in this case, women- is their gender based social networks, i.e. social capital (1986). Through forming strong relationships and wide networks at the marketplace, the women get access to new knowledge and what seems to be a way to gain control over capital which is otherwise controlled by men.

3 Concluding discussion- change and continuity in the social practice of gender

Selling at the food market is indeed a feminine practice. In Kiwira, it is not a desirable occupation for a man. The idea of 'Rungwe women' (or Tukyuyu women) forms a certain identity for the women sellers of Kiwira. It becomes a kind of femininity which they can identify with because it includes doing business as a natural part of being a woman. Though the women independently manage a business, there are certain institutions and practices which constitutes them as dependent on their husbands. Institutions such as the patrilocal system and wife inheritance constitute men as the taken for granted owners of land and property. As the handling of money is considered a masculine practice, many women hand over their profit to their husband but decide to hide parts of it for themselves. Though the women in large lack access to financial capital, their activities at the marketplace entail them with a large social capital. The women choose to lay considerable amounts of time and energy on accumulating and maintaining this social capital, which they do wisely as this social capital in different ways can be transformed into financial capital and ultimately more freedom of maneuver. As the marketplace consists of a majority of women, there are several leadership positions available for women in the organization of the Traders Union. Women can become legitimate leaders through the acquisition of a reputation as 'trustworthy', which is attained through a wide and well-maintained social capital. However, as there is an overrepresentation of men in the board, it seems that there are connotations between leadership positions and a masculine gender, such as having authority and access to financial capital. The many household duties assigned to women limit their mobility by putting restrictions on how much time they can dedicate to their business. Especially the duty of cooking breakfast, lunch and dinner force the women to spend less time at the market than they would like to. However, even here the social capital attained at the market can alleviate, as the example of the seller Doreen shows. While selling is considered a feminine practice, the study shows that traveling is believed to be a masculine practice. Traveling is explained as something that unmarried or divorced women can do. Instead of traveling to buy their products, women sellers with high capital make contact with middlemen to arrange with transport from other districts. Both household duties assigned to women and ideas on what is appropriate behavior for women form part in creating this situation.

A process of change that can be traced to the women's business activities is the critical discussion that exists around responsibilities within the household. Both men and women describe selling at the market as a legitimate practice for women, and none of the groups express any direct contradiction between selling at the market and being a mother or wife. However, the practical consequences of women's business activities lead to a struggle over what actually constitutes the performance of a good and moral femininity. This struggle indicates a state of heterodoxy rather than doxa, where the men attempt to defend their domination through expressions of discontent with the changes that they see. This orthodox discourse emphasizes a woman's traditional role as complementary to her husband where her income is not a sign of her independence but only an addition to her husband's. It also warns for what happens when women work too much or earn too much money, as this might compete with a woman's duties in the household and threaten the man's superior position. The message is that the consequences of the changes of balance will be detrimental to society, with separations and malnutrition as the result. The women's discourse instead encompasses the idea about 'Rungwe women' who do business for the sake of their family, and in fact where it is their obligation to do so. This message is vigorously expressed in the previously presented quote from one of the saleswomen:

In this generation, if you are a woman and you are not doing anything, we are going to wonder about you. We will see you as mentally disabled. Women should do business in order to meet needs of her children and family.

(woman at focus group)

In this discourse, the woman's income is the most important income to the household, since it is seen as more reliable than a man's. The men's accusation of women acting *kiburi* is seen as something rather ridiculous, because the women are aware of the importance of their business for the household. Therefore, the fulfilling of household duties and acting subordinate towards the husband are concerns which come in second hand. I argue that this heterodoxy has come about as a consequence of the many women engaged as sellers within the community. The women's experiences of earning money and managing a business forms the basis of expressions of heterodoxy. The marketplace as a meeting place plays an important part in this. As Bourdieu (1977), as well as Moi (1991) and Lovell (2003) argue, an act which goes against the norm becomes effective in creating change when it can be placed in a discourse which is considered legitimate among a larger group of people. At the Kiwira marketplace, women with various ways of life can meet and learn from each other. Together they can give new meanings to common experiences. The jokes about separating their husbands, though only a joke, works to create a shared identity as independent women. And the agreement on the lost legitimacy of calling a woman *kiburi* is part of establishing a common idea of what constitutes a righteous femininity in Kiwira, in opposition to a woman's traditional role. The relations made at the marketplace also provides a possibility to, what seems to be a way of, avoiding men's controlling of their income through the *michezo* savings system.

From the discussions I have participated in and observed at the Kiwira market, two versions of a 'bad woman' have emerged. One is a woman who fails to perform her duties as a wife and thinks she is superior of her husband: a *kiburi* woman. The other is a woman who starts selling at the market with the intention of meeting other men: an unfaithful or even prostituted woman. While the idea of women as *kiburi* is explicitly contested by several women in Kiwira, the idea that it is dangerous for a man to let his wife travel or sometimes even to work as a seller at the market seems not to be. Instead women need to prove and make clear their own position as 'good' women, as opposed to women who are not. The idea that some women at the market are unfaithful and even prostitutes is legitimate among both men and women, leaving little space for expressions of heterodoxy. This idea is instead an example of the effective workings of symbolic violence, as women -by using the narrative themselves- become part in reproducing the gender norms which dominate them and limit their freedom of movement (Bourdieu, 2001). Unlike the topic of women as income-bringer to the household, the topic of traveling women is not something which I have found to be discussed among the women. Perhaps it might be that the women who travel in their business are so few that forming a shared identity around it is difficult. It might also be that the women who do travel do not wish to make this a part of their identity as the risk of being labeled as unfaithful is high and the social sanctions might be severe. This since the narrative is legitimate also among many women, and because men have reason to make sure they are not seen as having a wife that is out of their control. Noted here should be that two young persons in my study did question the legitimacy of the narrative of women who travel as unfaithful, hence there might exist different opinions on this among a younger generation. Worth noting is also that only two traveling women were part of my study, why it would be interesting topic for further studies.

This study has shown that the social practice of gender in and around the Kiwira market is subject to processes both change and continuity. Change through heterodoxic discourse concerning femininity, and continuity through symbolic violence which reproduces norms that limit women's freedom of movement. It has also shown that themes brought up in the literature on market women in urban and suburban areas are equally relevant in rural settings. The importance of women's social networks which are formed at the marketplace additionally advises authorities to be cautious not to break these through unthoughtful disruptions.

4 References

Acker, J. (1992) From Sex-Roles to Gendered Institutions. *Contemporary Sociology*, 21(5). 565-569

Augustsson, C. (2019) Gender relations in the production of cocoa at household level in Kyela, Tanzania (working title). Forthcoming master's thesis. Swedish University of Agricultural Studies. Department of urban and rural development.

Bourdieu, P. (1977) *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Bourdieu, P. (1984). *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. London: Routledge

Bourdieu, P. (1986). The Forms of Capital. In N. W. Biggart (Ed.), *Readings in Economic Sociology* (pp. 280–291).

Bourdieu, P. (2001). *Masculine domination*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press

Bourdieu, P., Passeron, J.C. (1977). *Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture*. London: Sage

Bourdieu, P., Wacquant, L. (1992). *An Invitation to Reflexive Sociology* Cambridge. University of Chicago.

Bryman, A. (2016) *Social Research Methods* 5:th ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Burrell, J. (2014). Modernity in material form? Mobile phones in the careers of Ghanaian market women. *Review of African Political Economy*, 41(142), 579–593.

Creswell, J.W. (2014) *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. (4th ed.). London: SAGE Publications

- Connell, R. (1985). THEORISING GENDER. *Sociology*, 19(2), 260-272. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/42853232>
- Davies, C. (2008). *Reflexive Ethnography*. London: Routledge
- Duncan, J. (2014) Women's Land Rights Guide for Tanzania. Center for Women's Land Rights. Landesa.
- Durey, A. (2008) Rural medical marriages: Understanding symbolic violence in the social practice of gender. *Women's International Forum*, 31, 73-81
- Flyvbjerg, B. (2006) Five Misunderstanding about Case-Study Research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 12(2), 219-245
- de Groot, J., Mohlakoana, N., Knox, A., & Bressers, H. (2017). Fuelling women's empowerment? An exploration of the linkages between gender, entrepreneurship and access to energy in the informal food sector. *Energy Research & Social Science*, 28, 86–97.
- Habiba, I. (2017) Effects of customary law in widows' inheritance right to matrimonial properties at Ruanda Ward in Mbeya City, Tanzania. Open University of Tanzania. Department of Social Work
- Kyriacou, A. (2015) Individualism-Collectivism, Governance and Economic Development. MPRA Paper no.65151. Available at: <https://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/65151/>
- Lovell, T. (2003). Resisting with Authority: Historical Specificity, Agency and the Performative Self. *Theory, Culture and Society*, 20(1). 1-17.
- Mandel, J. (2004). Mobility Matters: women livelihood strategies in Porto Novo, Benin. *Gender, Place & Culture*, 11(2). 257-287.
- Mbululo, Y., Nyihirani, F. (2012) Climate Characteristics over Southern Highlands Tanzania. *Atmospheric and Climate Sciences*, 2, 454-463.
- McLeod, J. (2005). Feminists re-reading Bourdieu: Old debates and new questions about gender habitus and gender change. *School Field*, 3(1), 11–30.
- McNay, L. (2004). Agency and Experience: Gender as a Lived Relation. *The Sociological Review*, 52(2), 175–190.
- Meagher, K. (2005). Social capital or analytical liability? Social networks and African informal economies. *Global Networks*, 5(3), 217–238

Moi, T. (1991) Appropriating Bourdieu: Feminist Theory and Pierre Bourdieu's Sociology of Culture. *New Literary History*, Vol. 22, No. 4, Papers from the Commonwealth Center for Literary and Cultural Change (Autumn, 1991), p. 1017-1049

NBS- National Bureau of Statistics, Ministry of Agriculture and Food Security, Ministry of Water and Livestock Development, Ministry of Cooperatives and Marketing, President's Office, Regional Administration and Local Government. (2007). Volume VI: Regional Report: Mbeya Region. Available at: <http://www.nbs.go.tz/nbs/takwimu/Agriculture/MBEYA%20REGION%20REPORT.pdf> [Retrieved 2019-08-21]

Ngailo, J. A., Mwakasendo, J. A., Kisandu, D. B., Mlowe, F. C., & Tippe, D. E. (2016). Rice farming in the Southern Highlands of Tanzania: Management practices, socio-economic roles and production constraints. *European Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, 4(4), 12.

Nyanzi, B., Nyanzi, S., Wolff, B., & Whitworth, J. (2005). Money, men and markets: Economic and sexual empowerment of market women in southwestern Uganda. *Culture, Health & Sexuality*, 7(1), 13–26.

Pollard, G., Davies, M., Moore, H. (2015). Women, marketplaces and exchange partners among the Marakwet of northwest Kenya. *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 9(3), 412-439

Porter, G. (2011) 'I think a woman who travels a lot is befriending other men and that's why she travels': mobility constraints and their implications for rural women and girls in Sub-Saharan Africa. *Gender, Place and Culture*, 18(1), 65-81.

Portes, A. (2010). *Economic Sociology- A Systemic Inquiry*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Robben, A. (2012). Introduction. In: Robben, a., Sluka, J. (ed.) *Ethnographic Fieldwork: an anthropologic reader*. (2nd ed.) Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell

Schindler, K. (2010). Credit for What? Informal Credit as a Coping Strategy of Market Women in Northern Ghana. *Journal of Development Studies*, 46(2), 234–253.

Seligmann, L. (1993). Between worlds of exchange: Ethnicity among Peruvian market women. *Cultural Anthropology* 8(2), 187–213.

Silverman, D. (2015). *Interpreting Qualitative Data*. (5th ed.) London: SAGE Publications.

Simon, S. (2007). *Promises and challenges of the informal food sector in developing countries*. Rome, Italy: FAO. Retrieved from <ftp://ftp.fao.org/docrep/fao/010/a1124e/a1124e00.pdf>

- Sowatey, E., Nyantakyi-Frimpong, H., Mkandawire, P., Arku, G., Hussey, L. & Amasaba, A. (2018). Spaces of resilience, ingenuity, and entrepreneurship in informal work in Ghana. *International Planning Studies*.
- Spring, A. (2009) African Women in the Entrepreneurial Landscape: Reconsidering the Informal and Formal Sector. *Journal of African Business*, 10. 11-30
- Svensson, J., & Wamala Larsson, C. (2016). Situated empowerment: Mobile phones practices among market women in Kampala. *Mobile Media & Communication*, 4(2), 205–220.
- Tillmar, M. (2016). Gendering of Commercial Justice-experience of self-employed women in urban Tanzania. *Journal of Enterprising Communities: People and Places in the Global Economy*, 10(1). 101-122
- Tillmar, M., Lindkvist, L (2007) Cooperation Against All Odds- Finding Reasons for Trust where Formal Institutions Fail. *International Sociology*, 22(3). 343-366
- Tripp, A.M. (1997) Changing the rules: The political economy of liberalization and the urban informal economy of Tanzania. London and Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Uteng, T.P., Cresswell, T, (2008) Gendered mobilities: Towards an holistic understanding. In *Gendered mobilities*, ed. T.P. Uteng and T. Cresswell, 1-12. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Weng, X. (2015). *The rural informal economy* (p. 29). International Institute for Environment and Development.
- West, C., Zimmerman, D. (1987). Doing Gender. *Gender and Society*, 1(2), 125-151.
- Wiley, C.A. (2014). Joking market women: Critiquing and negotiating gender and social hierarchy in Kankossa, Mauretania. *Africa*, 84(1), 101-118.